Open letter to Australian governments on divesting from police and prisons

Recently we have witnessed Black Lives Matter protests around the world in response to police brutality and systemic racism. The international uprising from these growing movements has caused many Australians to pay attention to the voices of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people who have been campaigning for justice on these issues for decades. Since the 1991 Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody there have been 438 known deaths of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people in police or corrective services custody. There has been a chronic lack of accountability for these deaths.

End the over-criminalisation and over-imprisonment of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people

The overrepresentation of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people in every state and territory criminal justice system in Australia is longstanding and well-documented. The causes and impacts of this have long been recognised in a series of government reports and inquiries, stretching back at least to the 1991 Royal Commission.

Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people are some of the most incarcerated on earth, with their imprisonment rate exceeding that of African Americans. Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people comprise 2 per cent of the general population but 28 per cent of those in prison, making them 12 times more likely to be incarcerated than non-Indigenous Australians. This overrepresentation is even more dramatic in youth prisons, where Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander children comprise over half (58 per cent) of all those locked up, while comprising only 5 per cent of the youth population. These gross levels of incarceration, especially of Aboriginal children, represent one of Australia’s most significant human rights breaches.

There is an urgent need to raise the age of criminal responsibility to keep young children out of prison. The minimum age of criminal responsibility in Australia is 10 years. This is out of step with international human rights standards and academic literature on the neurodevelopment of children. A low age of criminal responsibility disproportionately affects Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander children who comprise the majority of those aged 10-13 who are criminalised. We support national calls to raise the age of criminal responsibility in Australia to at least 14 years to reduce the criminalisation of very young children.

Almost 30 years ago the Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody emphasised the urgent need to act to reduce the incarceration of Aboriginal people. It emphasised that the solutions lay largely outside the criminal justice system and that Aboriginal self-determination is fundamental to eliminating disadvantage and empowering Indigenous communities. Yet, earlier this month, media reports on draft new Closing the Gap targets highlighted a target for parity in the incarceration rates of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people by 2093. The shocking proposal that Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people can wait 73 years to address current levels of over-representation demonstrates an extreme complacency and a willingness on the part of the government to subject generations of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people to more violence, imprisonment and trauma.
The over-imprisonment of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people was the focus of the Australian Law Reform Commission’s (ALRC) *Pathways to Justice* report, which made 35 recommendations and set out a framework for reform. The report detailed in-depth what has been known in Australia for decades – that the criminalisation and over-incarceration of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people is intimately linked to entrenched poverty, disadvantage and the ongoing effects of colonial processes, as well as discrimination within the criminal justice system. The report was delivered to the commonwealth government in December 2017. As with most of the recommendations of previous commissions and inquiries regarding fundamental reform, the government has so far failed to implement the recommendations or formally respond. As a matter of urgency, we call on federal, state and territory governments to respond to and implement the recommendations of the ALRC report to reduce the criminalisation and incarceration of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people.

**Divest from police and prisons and invest in positive social and community services**

The Black Lives Matter movements have also brought into the mainstream, proposals to defund and divest from police and prisons and to instead focus resources on the socio-economic needs of communities. By investing in housing, early educational, family, social and health support, we can ameliorate many of the social issues which are known drivers of criminalisation and incarceration, and thereby enhance community and public safety. These types of social and community investments have been the consistent recommendations of previous reports.

All demographic information confirms that those who come into contact with the criminal justice system are significantly more disadvantaged than the general population. They are far more likely to have experiences of trauma; previous contact with child protection and youth justice systems; and to be homeless or experiencing housing instability. Alongside this, people enmeshed in the criminal justice system have disproportionately high levels of mental health disorders and cognitive impairment; substance use addictions; and chronic health conditions. Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people experience these disadvantages at a significantly higher rate. The 1991 Royal Commission into Aboriginal Deaths in Custody recognised the ways in which these social determinants of imprisonment drive cycles of incarceration.

**Increasing use of prisons to address social problems**

For many years our governments have used criminalisation and imprisonment as a solution to multi-layered and complicated social disadvantages. This has re-intensified in Australia over recent decades with the rapid increase of the growth of imprisonment alongside significant downward trends in crime. Notwithstanding the effects of COVID 19 on temporarily reducing prisoner numbers, Australian prison populations have reached record levels. From 2012 to 2019, the Australian prison population increased by 40 per cent, driven largely by increased rates of those on remand, women and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people. The substantial growth in the number of people denied bail and held on remand means that unsentenced prisoners now account for one-third of the total Australian prisoner population.

Enormous public resources are spent on punitive criminal justice practices across all Australian states and territories. In recent years police and justice budgets have drastically outpaced spending in other areas. From 2008-09 to 2018-2019, Australian police budgets increased by 61 per cent, from $7.68 billion to $12.4 billion. Annual expenditure on prisons alone in Australia in 2018-2019 was $3.79 billion. All jurisdictions are building more or expanding...
current prisons to accommodate growing numbers. As prisons are used as to manage growing numbers of people with complex health, educational and social needs, rehabilitation efforts are inadequate to the task and overwhelmed by the demand. Almost half of those released from prison will return within two years. It is clear that prisons do not ‘rehabilitate’, reform or deter the vast majority of those who have been there before.

As researchers, we understand and acknowledge the need to invest in solutions which are underpinned by evidence. The evidence is clear that in Australia and elsewhere, policing and prisons have become social problems in themselves. Contemporary policing practices cause significant harm to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people who are over-policed and subject to surveillance and monitoring that produces offences and arrests. We recognise this also affects other ethnic minority communities who are subject to over-policing. The social and economic costs of prison are immense. Australian society is diminished by the increasing use of prison to address multi-layered social disadvantage.

No serious response to the problems of over-criminalisation, police harassment and surveillance (and the absence of adequate processes for complaint and independent investigation), and growing prison numbers will occur without a fundamental shift in power from government to community and a redeployment of money and material resources. We must stop investing in punitive criminal justice responses which trap people in cycles of imprisonment and disadvantage and instead refocus these resources on the social and economic needs of communities. As was recognised by the ALRC, any investment into communities which seeks to address the criminalisation and over-imprisonment of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people must be Aboriginal community owned, developed and led, and underpinned by principles of self-determination. The ALRC highlighted the efforts of communities who are attempting to reorient the use of punitive responses to positive community engagement, including under the banner of justice reinvestment (for example, in Bourke and other places), as well as other local community led initiatives such as Aboriginal community patrols and sentencing courts.

Our call to action

This letter constitutes an urgent call for the recommendations outlined in the ALRC Pathways to Justice report and previous government inquiries and royal commissions to be put into practice. As these reports and research evidence make clear, criminal justice without social justice is not just or fair.

We call for:
- specific investment in effective diversion for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people caught in criminal justice cycles;
- raising the age of criminal responsibility to 14 years of age;
- an end to ever-increasing police and corrections budgets;
- investment in community services and structural initiatives led by Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people;
- real government support for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples’ calls for self-determination, control and voice, and for significant social and economic investment in their communities.

Signed:
Imogen Richards, Alfred Deakin Institute, Faculty of Arts & Education, Deakin University
Marilyn McMahon, School of Law, Deakin University
Dr Virginia Marshall, RegNet & Fenner, ANU
Sophie Rigney, Indigenous Law Centre, UNSW
Alison Whittaker, Jumbunna Institute for Indigenous Education and Research, UTS
Associate Professor Rebecca Wickes, School of Social Science, Monash University, Melbourne, VIC
Patrick Horton, Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, University of Sydney
Liz Campbell, Faculty of Law, Monash University
Rob White, Distinguished Professor, School of Social Sciences, University of Tasmania
Vicky Nagy, School of Social Sciences, University of Tasmania
Kirsty Gover, Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne
Jason Moore, PhD Candidate, School of Law, University of New South Wales
Diarmaid Harkin, Senior Lecturer in Criminology, Deakin University
Jeni Engel, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Emma Russell, School of Humanities and Social Sciences, La Trobe University
David Dixon, UNSW Law
Erica Millar, La Trobe University
Anthony Hopkins, ANU College of Law
Kate Burns, School of Social Sciences, Monash University
Diana Johns, School of Social & Political Sciences, The University of Melbourne
Erin Buckley, Faculty of Law, La Trobe University
Kate Fitz-Gibbon, Monash Gender and Family Violence Prevention Centre, Faculty of Arts, Monash University
Alison Young, School of Social & Political Sciences, University of Melbourne
Russell Hogg, Faculty of Law, QUT
Chris Martin, Built Environment, UNSW Sydney
Penny Crofts, Faculty of Law, UTS
Gabriela Franich, Faculty of Law, La Trobe University
Nicole Ryan, Faculty of Law, La Trobe University
Kath Gelber, School of Political Science and International Studies, University of Queensland
Claire Loughnan, School of Social and Political Sciences, University of Melbourne
Bianca Fileborn, School of Social & Political Sciences, University of Melbourne
Garner Clancey, Sydney Law School, University of Sydney
Fiona Haines, School of Social and Political Sciences, University of Melbourne
Kathryn Henna, School of Regulation and Global Governance, ANU
Daniel Joyce, Faculty of Law, UNSW Sydney
Jamie Walvisch, Faculty of Law, Monash University
Ruth McCausland, Institute for Global Development, School of Social Sciences, UNSW
Kerry Carrington, QUT Centre for Justice, QUT
Jane Sanders, Principal Solicitor, The Shopfront Youth Legal Centre
Rebecca Bunn, School of Social and Political Sciences, University of Melbourne
Jane Irwin, Senior Associate, The Shopfront Youth Legal Service
Jacki Maxton, Senior Associate, The Shopfront Youth Legal Service
James Boughton, Caseworker, The Shopfront Youth Legal Service
Lindsay Farmer, School of Law, University of Glasgow, UK.
Bridget Harris, Centre for Justice, QUT
Eddie Synot, Indigenous Law Centre, UNSW
Gabriel Garcia, Senior Lecturer, School of Law, University of Wollongong
Caitlin Hughes, Centre for Crime Policy and Research, Flinders University
Phillip Wadds, School of Social Sciences, UNSW
Winifred Agnew-Pauley, Centre for Crime Policy and Research, Flinders University
Phillip Screen, Centre for Crime Policy and Research, Flinders University
Stuart Kinner, Melbourne School of Population and Global Health, University of Melbourne; Centre for Adolescent Health, Murdoch Children’s Research Institute
Bree Carlton, Faculty of Arts & Education Deakin University
Maria Giannacopoulos, Flinders Law, Flinders University
Marinella Marmo, Flinders Law, Flinders University
Georgia van Toorn, School of Sociology and Social Policy, University of Sydney
Tamara Walsh, School of Law, University of Queensland
Leah Williams Veazey, School of Social & Political Sciences, University of Sydney
Dylan Lino, School of Law, University of Queensland
Alyce McGovern, School of Social Sciences, UNSW Sydney
Rhiannon Bandiera, Department of Law, Maynooth University, Ireland.
Amanda George, Flat Out Inc
Catherine Bond, UNSW Law
Jenny Bargen, Sydney Law
Emma Ryan, Faculty of Arts & Education Deakin University
Jenna Mizzi, Centre for Crime Policy and Research, Flinders University
Joni Meenagh, Criminology and Justice Studies, RMIT
Melissa de Vel-Palumbo, Criminology, Flinders University
Natalie Elson, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Jonathon Hunyor, Public Interest Advocacy Centre
Helena Menih, School of Humanities and Social Sciences, La Trobe University
Shelley Eder, Asia Pacific School of Business and Law, Charles Darwin University
Lindsay Pearce, Melbourne School of Population and Global Health, University of Melbourne
Isabelle Reinecke, Grata Fund
Maria Nawaz, Grata Fund
Killian Quigley, Sydney Environment Institute, University of Sydney
Leanne Weber, School of Social Sciences, Monash University
Rohan Borschmann, Melbourne School of Population and Global Health, University of Melbourne; Centre for Adolescent Health, Murdoch Children’s Research Institute
Monica Carvalheiro, Matilda Centre for Research in Mental Health & Substance Use, University of Sydney
Carolyn Strange, School of History, Australian National University
Meredith Rossner, ANU College of Arts and Sciences
Tess Deegan, Kingsford Legal Centre, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Kerry Tongue, Elizabeth Evatt Community Legal Centre, Board Member
Alaina Vaisey, Melbourne School of Population and Global Health, University of Melbourne
Chloe Conroy, The Matilda Centre, University of Sydney
Armin Alimardani, School of Law, Faculty of Business and Law, UOW
Camilla Pandolfi, Public Interest Advocacy Centre
Gudrun Dewey, Public Interest Advocacy Centre
Chadwick Wong, Public Interest Advocacy Centre
Emma Colvin, Senior Lecturer, Centre for Law and Justice, Charles Sturt University
Jo Shulman, Redfern Legal Centre
Sharmilla Bargon, Redfern Legal Centre
Gayatri Nair, Redfern Legal Centre
Sophie Parker, Redfern Legal Centre
Janice Yeung, Redfern Legal Centre
Jacqui Swinburne, Redfern Legal Centre
Amanda Brooker, Redfern Legal Centre
Andrew Groves, Faculty of Arts & Education, Deakin University
Brian-John Attard, Redfern Legal Centre
Alison Mackey, Redfern Legal Centre
Rebecca McMahon, Solicitor, Adjunct Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Andrea Durbach, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Regina Featherstone, Redfern Legal Centre
Marijke Bassani, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Erin Kelly, University of Sydney
Simon Rice, University of Sydney Law School
Emma Anderson, Kingsford Legal Centre, Faculty of Law, UNSW Sydney
Carolyn McKay, University of Sydney Law School
Penelope Purcell, Purcell Lawyers
Paul Townsend, Legal Aid NSW
Michael Levy AM, School of Medicine, Australian National University
Nataasha Baker, University of Sydney
Leah Findlay, UNSW Law
Samantha Lee, Redfern Legal Centre
Alistair Wyvill SC, William Forster Chambers, Darwin
Marisela Velazquez, Visiting Academic Researcher, James Cook University
Andrew Harris, Andrew Harris & Associates, Solicitors
Fiona Allison, Jumbunna, UTS; Cairns Institute, JCU
Jenny Lovric, Just Reinvest NSW
Sarah Hopkins, Aboriginal Legal Service NSW/ACT and Just Reinvest NSW
David Hofierka, Redfern Legal Centre
Samineh Sanatkar, Centre for Brain and Mental Health Research, University of Newcastle
Stephen Castles, Honorary Professor in Sociology, University of Sydney
Lauren Rogers, Centre for Brain and Mental Health Research, University of Newcastle
Hannah Cootes, Centre for Brain and Mental Health Research, University of Newcastle NSW
Maxine Robinson, Centre for Brain and Mental Health Research, University of Newcastle NSW
Rosie Jimson-Healey, Redfern Legal Centre
Gloria Larman, Women’s Justice Network
Peita Savage, Savage Solicitors
Paul Simpson, School of Public Health and Community Medicine, UNSW Sydney
Megan Williams, National Centre for Cultural Competence, University of Sydney
Hugh Finn, Curtin Law School, Curtin University
Samantha Camilleri, Judy Courtin Legal
Millicent McCreath, UNSW Law
Guy S. Goodwin-Gill, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Genna Churches, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Alex Steel, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Sam Hartridge, Faculty of Law, UNSW; Aperion Law
Andy Symington, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Matthew Ball, School of Justice, QUT
Danielle Tyson, Criminology, Deakin University
Jodi Death, QUT Centre for Justice, QUT
Bassina Farbenblum, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Lynsey Blayden, UNSW Law
Laura Bedford, Criminology, Deakin University
Lisa Durnian, QUT Centre for Justice, QUT
Gabrielle Appleby, UNSW Law
Valeria Coscini, ANU
Benjamin Ettinger, ANU College of Law
Amelia Simpson, ANU College of Law
Colin James, ANU College of Law
Molly Townes O’Brien, ANU College of Law
Michael Tarlowski, ANU College of Law
Stephen Bottomley, ANU College of Law
Nick Seddon
Danielle Watson, QUT Centre for Justice, QUT
Juliet Rogers, University of Melbourne, Criminology
Richard Chisholm, Honorary Professor, ANU College of Law
Claire Spivakovsky, University of Melbourne, Criminology
Dr Peter Whellum, Law Society of SA Aboriginal Issues Committee
David (and Sally) Letts, ANU College of Law
Kate Ogg, ANU College of Law
Pearl Beaumont, Solicitor and Centre for Crime, Law and Justice, UNSW Law
Claire Ferguson, Faculty of Law, QUT
Alisha Nolan, ANU
Alissa Macoun, QUT Centre for Justice, QUT
Alessandro Pelizzon, Southern Cross University, School of Law and Justice
Angela Kintominas, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Margaret Thornton, ANU College of Law
Hugh Dillon, UNSW Law
Mehera San Roque, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Tony Foley, ANU College of Law
Brooke Greenwood, Public Interest Advocacy Centre
Bronwen Morgan, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Brendan Edgeworth, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Rose Coppin, ANU College of Law
Marc De Leeuw, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Cristy Clark, Faculty of Business, Government and Law, University of Canberra
Jonathan Bonnitcha, Faculty of Law, UNSW
Anna Copeland, School of Law, Murdoch University
Mi-Lin Chen Yi Mei, Centre for Innovative Justice, RMIT
Alysha Byrne, Deakin Law Clinic, Deakin University
Liam Elphick, UWA Law School
Caitlyn O’Halloran, Deakin University
Kristina Bucak, Mental Health Legal Centre
Jeremy King, Victorian President, Australian Lawyers Alliance
Paul Kidd, Fitzroy Legal Service
William R Wood, School of Criminology and Criminal Justice, Griffith University
Susanne Karstedt, Professor, School of Criminology and Criminal Justice, Griffith University
Ross Homel, Foundation Professor, School of Criminology and Criminal Justice, Griffith University
Susan Dennison, School of Criminology and Criminal Justice, Griffith University